
Desmigratif Program: Implementation Evaluation and Policy Recommendations for Sustainability Enhancement

Firdausi Nuzula*, Hendry Roza, Muhammad Fikrie Hazami

Ministry of Manpower – The Republic of Indonesia

*Email Correspondence: firdausinuzula.02225@gmail.com

Abstract

The Desmigratif Program is an initiative of the Indonesian government to provide protection and empowerment for Indonesian Migrant Workers (PMI). Based on the evaluation results, the Desmigratif Program has had a positive impact on the welfare of PMI and their families. Several aspects that are the focus of the evaluation include the effectiveness of migration services, the sustainability of productive businesses, involvement in community parenting, and the role of cooperatives and BUMDes in supporting the local economy. The evaluation shows that coordination between actors at the local and central levels is key to the success of the program. However, the evaluation also noted several challenges faced, such as limited human resources and a lack of supporting technological infrastructure. The success of the Desmigratif Program is highly dependent on the synergy between local governments, communities, and the private sector. Strong regulatory support, adequate budget allocation, and increased community capacity and participation are key to the sustainability of the program. Routine evaluation and ongoing technical guidance are also important to ensure that the program can continue to grow and provide benefits to retired PMI and their families.

Keywords: desmigratif, program evaluation, Indonesian migrant workers (PMI), synergy between institutions, PMI empowerment.

DOI:10.47198/naker.v19i3.433

Received: 19-11-2024

Revised: 16-12-2024

Accepted: 30-12-2024

1. Introduction

In accordance with the mandate of Law No. 18 of 2017 concerning the Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers, the Desmigratif program is an innovative effort to protect the interests of CPMI/PMI/Retired PMI and their families in fulfilling their rights through activities before work, during work, and after work in legal, economic, and social aspects starting from the village. This program aims to: a) support villages in serving the process of placement and protection of prospective workers who will work, both domestically and abroad; b) empower

retired Indonesian workers and their families; c) encourage the active role of the village government and all stakeholders; and d) reduce the number of non-procedural workers (Ministry of Manpower of the Republic of Indonesia, 2019).

Since 2017, based on the Decree of the Minister of Manpower No. 59 of 2017 which was later replaced by the Decree of the Minister of Manpower No. 2 In 2019, 503 villages have been formed into Productive Migrant Villages (Desmigratif), spread across 123 Regencies/Cities and 16 Provinces until the end of 2022 (Ministry of Manpower of the Republic of Indonesia, 2022). This program has shown significant progress. However, there are obstacles that have resulted in the temporary discontinuation of the addition of Desmigratif locations. Research shows that the main obstacle is caused by the failure to implement optimal coordination and collaboration in program development (Nuraeni, 2021).

The success of the program is greatly influenced by the ability to overcome these obstacles. A holistic approach to planning has proven effective in improving the welfare of migrant workers and preventing illegal migration (Nuraeni, 2021). In addition, community-based implementation and the use of modern technology can also help overcome various challenges. For example, the use of digital technology in recording migrant worker data can increase the efficiency and accuracy of information (Setiawan, 2020).

In order for the implementation of the Desmigratif program to be right on target, the effectiveness factor is the main basis for achieving goals. Effectiveness here refers to the level of success of an organization in carrying out its activities in accordance with its stated objectives (Bryson, 2018). An integrated evaluation system can be a strategic tool for the government to manage policy interventions, ensure accountability, and encourage continuous policy improvement (World Bank, 2019).

With an integrated evaluation framework, the government can understand how the program is producing change and improve its implementation in the future. The experience of the Desmigratif program evaluation can also be a model for integrating similar evaluation frameworks into other policies.

This study aims to:

- a. Analyze the sustainability of the Desmigratif program and the involvement and interaction of the actors within it;
- b. Identify supporting and inhibiting factors for program sustainability;
- c. Identifying criteria for measuring program sustainability.

2. Research Method

This study uses qualitative and quantitative approaches. The data used in this evaluation study consists of primary and secondary data. Data collection was carried out to analyze the implementation of the Desmigratif program, map and examine the actors involved and their interactions in the sustainability of the program. Primary data came from 503 Desmigratif taken

as a sample of 210 villages from 130 districts/cities and 8 provinces. Of the 210 villages selected, field visits were conducted in 10 villages while FGDs were conducted in the other 200 villages.

Field visits in each village were conducted for three days using observation methods, questionnaire distribution and in-depth interviews with actors. Based on the technical unit implementing the Desmigratif program, the success rate of each village program was different so samples were selected based on three categories, namely good, moderate and poor. In the field data collection, 10 locations were selected as follows:

- a. Kenanga Village, Indramayu Regency, West Java;
- b. Kuripan Village, Wonosobo Regency, Central Java;
- c. Betak Village, Tulungagung Regency, East Java;
- d. Anjani Village, East Lombok Regency, NTB;
- e. Gembongan Mekar Village, Kab. Cirebon, West Java;
- f. Ponain Village, Kupang Regency, NTT;
- g. Village of Tanjung Beringin, Serdang Bedagai Regency, North Sumatra;
- h. Bojongjaya Village, Subang Regency, West Java;
- i. Bumijaya Village, Serang Regency, Banten;
- j. Geger Village, Bangkalan Regency, East Java.

In addition to field visits, data collection was also carried out through Focus Group Discussions (FGD). The FGD activity was carried out on May 20-22, 2024, located at the Aston Kartika Grogol Hotel, Jakarta to map the actors more comprehensively and their respective roles. This FGD invited participants from 200 participants consisting of coordinators, village administrators and desmigratif officers throughout Indonesia. FGD participants were grouped based on their respective roles into *the Brake Out Room*, then the moderator explored information to explore the views and experiences of the actors regarding the Desmigratif Program, with a special focus on its implementation in the village, as well as identify supporting and inhibiting factors for the sustainability of the program. The parties who will be the resource persons in this evaluation activity are:

- a. Ministry of Home Affairs, Directorate General of Regional Development;
- b. Ministry of Villages, Development of Disadvantaged Regions and Transmigration;
- c. Ministry of Women and Children Protection;
- d. Ministry of Manpower;
- e. Inspirational Desmigratif Officer from Kenanga Village;
- f. BRI Bank KCP Ministry of Manpower;
- g. Migrant Care.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. The Importance of Desmigration Programs and Their Impacts

3.1.1. The Importance of Desmigrative Programs

Based on the results of data collection, the assessment of the importance of the Desmigratif Program was very positive in all groups involved. The program was considered to have a real positive impact, improving the welfare of migrant workers and their families, empowering rural communities economically, preventing social problems, and reducing illegal migration. The results of quantitative data processing as seen in table 4.1 show that the program is very effective and appreciated at various levels. This shows the success of the Desmigratif Program in achieving its goals and providing significant benefits to migrant workers and rural communities.

Table 1. 1of Desmigrative Programs Based on the Perspectives of the Actors Involved

No	Description	Mark	Caption
1	Coordinator of the Regency/City Manpower Office		
	- The Desmigratif Program has had a real positive impact on the targets	90.67%	Strongly agree
2	Village Responsible Person		
	- The Desmigratif program has had a real positive impact on migrant workers and their families.	86.32%	Strongly agree
3	Desmigratif Officer		
	- The Desmigratif Program is very important for improving the welfare of migrant workers and their families.	89.89%	Strongly agree
	- The Desmigratif Program plays an important role in empowering rural communities economically.	86.07%	Strongly agree
	- The Desmigratif Program is effective in preventing social problems faced by migrant workers and their families.	86.07%	Strongly agree
	- The Desmigratif program plays an important role in reducing illegal migration in villages	90.56%	Strongly agree
4	Desmigrative Community (CPMI/Retired PMI and their families)		
	- The Desmigratif Program is very important for the future of PMI and their families	100%	Strongly agree

Based on table 1 on the Importance of Desmigratif Programs Based on the Perspective of the Actors Involved, it can be analyzed as follows:

- a. Coordinator of the Regency/City Manpower Office: A score of 90.67% indicates that the Desmigratif program is considered very important and effective by the Coordinator of the Manpower Office. They agree that this program has a real positive impact on the target, namely Indonesian Migrant Workers (PMI) and their families. This indicates a

high appreciation for the impact of the program, especially in terms of management and its impact on the target group.

- b. Village Responsible Person: With a score of 86.32%, the village responsible person also strongly agreed that the Desmigratif program had a positive impact on PMI and their families. This shows that at the village level, this program is seen as an effective instrument in improving the welfare of PMI and their families and encouraging village economic empowerment.
- c. Desmigratif Officers: Desmigratif Officers provided some very positive views regarding various aspects of the program:
 - Important for the welfare of PMI and their families with a score of 89.89%. This indicates that officers working in the field fully support the program and see the real benefits it brings to the welfare of PMI.
 - Economic empowerment of rural communities was also considered important with a score of 86.07%, indicating that this program has succeeded in creating new economic opportunities and strengthening the local economy.
 - Prevention of social problems faced by PMI and their families received the same score, 86.07%, which indicates the effectiveness of the program in preventing social problems such as poverty, domestic violence, and other problems often experienced by PMI families.
 - The reduction in illegal migration was considered very high, with a value of 90.56%. This shows that the program has succeeded in reducing the number of non-procedural PMIs, which is one of the main targets of the program.
- d. The Desmigratif Community (CPMI/Retired PMI and their families) gave a score of 100% to the statement that the Desmigratif Program is very important for the future of PMI and their families. This indicates that all members of the community involved fully agree that this program has a very crucial role in maintaining the sustainability of their welfare in the future. This perfect score also shows that the Desmigratif program is not only seen as important for current conditions, but also has a significant long-term impact on the future of PMI and their families, both in terms of economy, social, and empowerment. This full support shows that the program has truly succeeded in achieving its main goal, which is to empower and improve the standard of living of PMI and their families.

3.1.2. Impact Felt by PMI and their Families

The Desmigratif program has had a significant positive impact on migrant workers and their families. The economic impact is seen through the improvement in the welfare of migrant workers' families facilitated by productive businesses, such as in Paringan Village, and Ponorogo Regency. In Bojongjaya Village, the convection business run by a group of former migrant workers is still running well to this day. This group produces plain t-shirts, and the income earned from the business has made a major contribution to improving the welfare of former migrant workers' families, helping them become more financially independent after returning from abroad.

The social and educational impacts are also felt through the *community parenting program* that ensures that PMI children receive proper early education and good care. In addition, this program helps reduce stunting rates and improve financial literacy in several areas. In Kenanga Village, PMI children who are left behind by parents working abroad receive good education and care through a joint Quran reading program and additional training at an educational house established specifically for them. This program helps maintain the social and educational stability of PMI children so that they do not get caught up in social problems such as lack of supervision or inadequate education.

The Desmigratif Program also helps reduce stunting rates and improve financial literacy in several areas. With the training and guidance provided, PMI husbands who were previously not involved in managing family finances now understand more about how to manage remittances wisely, as happened in Kenanga Village. This plays a major role in reducing divorce and social problems that PMI families often face. Overall, the Desmigratif Program has had a real positive impact, both in terms of economy, society, and education, thus improving the welfare of PMI and their families in various villages that are beneficiaries of this program.

3.2. Implementation of Desmigratif Program

3.2.1. Factors Supporting the Success of the Desmigratif Program

The successful implementation of this program is highly dependent on strong support, good coordination, and commitment from all parties involved. Supporting factors that have helped the Desmigratif program run more effectively and overcome the various challenges faced are as follows:

- a. **Support from Various Ministries and Institutions:** Support from related ministries and institutions, such as the Ministry of Manpower and the Ministry of Villages, is very important in providing policy and budget support for this program. The responsiveness of the Manpower Office (Disnaker) in handling PMI issues also helps villages in implementing the Desmigratif program more effectively. In Bojongjaya Village, Subang, support from the Ministry of Manpower and the Subang Regency Manpower Office enabled the Desmigratif program to run more smoothly. This program received adequate policy and budget assistance for the implementation of various initiatives, such as providing sewing machines for convection groups and catfish farming equipment. In Kuripan Village, Wonosobo, support from the Ministry of Manpower in the form of budget and facilities has improved the local economy by providing productive business equipment such as spin machines, stoves, and scales for groups of former PMI who run chicken floss-making businesses.
- b. **Good Synergy between Village Government and Desmigratif Officers:** Good cooperation between the village government and Desmigratif officers ensures smooth coordination and effective implementation. Support from the village head and village officials is essential in providing the necessary facilities and budget allocation. In

Kenanga Village, Indramayu, synergy between the village head, village officials, and Desmigratif officers ensures the program runs effectively. The Kenanga Village Head plays an active role in allocating village funds for the empowerment of former migrant workers, as well as supervising the departure of migrant workers. Something similar happened in Gembongan Mekar Village, Cirebon, where the village government actively facilitated its residents to follow safe migration procedures, reducing non-procedural departures.

- c. Initiative and Commitment of Field Officers: Desmigratif officers who have high initiative and commitment play a key role in overcoming various challenges in the field. Although their SKs were not extended, many officers continued to carry out their duties with the spirit of helping the community. Desmigratif officers in Kenanga Village played a very active role in driving micro, small and medium enterprises (MSMEs) and communities in their village. The success of these Desmigratif officers as *local champions* made this village a research site and pilot model for the Desmigratif program. In addition, Mrs. Wina as a Desmigratif officer also expanded the marketing network for MSME products to international markets such as South Korea.
- d. Community Involvement: Active participation of the village community in various Desmigratif program activities creates a sense of ownership and shared responsibility for the success of the program. This involvement includes support from PAUD teachers in the *community parenting pillar* and the sustainability of productive businesses run by PMI and their families. In Bojongjaya Village, the involvement of former PMI in the convection and catfish farming business group is very strong. The convection business involving 19 former PMI has managed to survive until now, providing economic benefits to the village community. Meanwhile, in Kuripan Village, the PMI community is actively routinely conducting teaching and learning activities for PMI children and providing entrepreneurship training to former PMI.
- e. Commitment and Competence of Human Resources: The high competence and commitment of Desmigratif officers are internal factors that greatly support the success of the program. Continuous training and technical guidance from the Ministry of Manpower help update the technical skills of officers. Training organized by the Ministry of Manpower in Kuripan Village, Wonosobo, has strengthened the competence of Desmigratif officers and village communities, especially in running productive businesses based on agricultural products such as processed snake fruit and chicken floss. In Bojongjaya Village, Subang, the high commitment of Desmigratif officers is maintained even though their contracts have ended. They remain active in running Desmigratif programs such as convection business groups involving former PMI.
- f. Availability of Sufficient Budget: Sufficient budget support from the APBN and APBD greatly influences the implementation of the program. This budget is used for various activities, including training and development of productive businesses. Kuripan Village received a sufficient budget from the Ministry of Manpower to support

productive businesses such as making chicken floss and batik handicrafts. Assistance in the form of equipment such as spin machines and cooking utensils was provided to business groups. In Kenanga Village, Indramayu, budget support was allocated for various activities such as MSME training and community parenting, which supported the success of businesses run by former PMI.

- g. Responsiveness of the Manpower Office: The responsiveness of the Manpower Office in handling PMI issues greatly assists villages in implementing the Desmigratif program. Good coordination with related agencies ensures that PMI issues can be handled quickly and effectively. In Gembongan Mekar Village, Cirebon, coordination between the Manpower Office and Desmigratif officers helped handle PMI cases quickly. The program also provides information on job opportunities and assists in a safe and procedural migration process. In Kuripan Village, Wonosobo, the Manpower Office's quick response helped resolve various non-procedural PMI cases. Desmigratif officers work together with the Manpower Office to provide information and assistance to prospective PMI so that they can go to work with safe procedures.
- h. Community Awareness and Participation: Community awareness of the importance of procedural document management and economic empowerment has increased. The community now better understands the importance of legality in working abroad and is more interested in participating in the training provided. In Kenanga Village, *community parenting activities* held by Desmigratif officers have increased community awareness of the importance of education for PMI children, as well as good parenting patterns. This program helps reduce the divorce rate and supports better financial management of PMI families. In Gembongan Mekar Village, community awareness has increased regarding the importance of legal and safe departures. The Desmigratif program helps village communities understand the migration process and the importance of financial management from PMI remittances, so they can avoid the risk of problems abroad.

With good support from various parties, good synergy between the government and officers, and commitment from Desmigratif officers and village communities, the Desmigratif program can run more effectively and provide real benefits for village communities and PMI. This program can provide a positive and sustainable impact on the welfare of migrant workers and their families.

3.2.2. Challenges of Sustainability of Desmigratif Program

The Desmigratif Program is faced with various challenges that hinder its implementation. Although this program has great potential to improve the welfare of rural communities, a number of internal and external obstacles often hinder the achievement of these goals. The main obstacles faced in the implementation of the Desmigratif Program, as well as the factors that cause difficulties in the operation of the Desmigratif program are as follows:

- a. **Lack of Central Government Involvement for Program Sustainability:** Lack of ongoing support from the central government is a major obstacle. Limited operational budgets often hinder the implementation of new activities and initiatives. In Bojongjaya Village, the Desmigratif program struggled with sustainability after budget support from the center ended. The village government did not allocate budget priorities to continue the program, so many initiatives stopped running. Village officials who were previously active in the Desmigratif program also began to shift their attention to other activities because they were no longer receiving funding.
- b. **Lack of Village Government Involvement:** After the change of village head in Bojongjaya, there was no priority budget allocation for the Desmigratif program. The new village head did not continue to support the program so that various initiatives that had been running previously were stopped. This shows that the program is very dependent on the commitment of the leadership in the village.
- c. **Dependence on Incentives for Officers:** Dependence on incentives for Desmigratif officers can reduce their motivation when incentives are not available. This can affect the sustainability and effectiveness of the program. In Gembongan Mekar Village, Cirebon, the turnover of Desmigratif officers became a serious challenge. When incentives and funding from the center stopped, previously active Desmigratif officers switched to other jobs. This caused the program to lack sustainability because the replacement officers did not have the same motivation, thus affecting the effectiveness of implementation.
- d. **Lack of Clear Legal Umbrella:** Kuripan Village, Wonosobo, is experiencing obstacles due to the lack of a strong legal umbrella to develop the Desmigratif program at the village level. Although the program is recognized as important, the lack of a legal basis in the village makes it difficult to provide long-term certainty and the necessary support.
- e. **Local Political Intervention:** Local political intervention often hampers program operations. Problems such as bad debts in cooperatives and changes in village heads who do not support the program can be serious obstacles. In Bojongjaya Village, the cooperative program that was formed experienced bad debts and management difficulties after a change in village head who no longer fully supported the Desmigratif program. In addition, the unclear legal umbrella at the village level means there is no strong basis for continuing the program, especially in the cooperative sector.
- f. **Limited Human Resource Capacity:** In Gembongan Mekar Village, the human resource capacity of cooperative managers is still low. Cooperatives formed by former PMI have not been running optimally due to the lack of training and skills in cooperative management. This is exacerbated by the lack of mentoring and training after the official program ends.
- g. **Technical Constraints:** Technical constraints such as poor internet signal and limited operational facilities in the village also hamper the implementation of the program. Many villages have difficulty running the program independently without continued

support from the central government. In Gembongan Mekar Village, infrastructure problems such as poor internet signal are obstacles to providing migration service information and entrepreneurship training effectively. In addition, limited facilities in the village make it difficult for communities to run productive business programs independently, especially when the facilities provided can no longer be accessed routinely.

- h. **Inconsistency of Productive Business Training:** In Kuripan Village, although productive business training such as processing salak and chicken floss has been carried out, its sustainability is not optimal. Business production only occurs based on orders, and the lack of further training has resulted in productive businesses not developing significantly. In addition, the equipment provided for training is often not utilized optimally because it is placed in the village hall and is difficult for participants to access.
- i. **Lack of Coordination Between Related Agencies:** Lack of synchronization between various ministries and institutions, such as the Ministry of Manpower, Ministry of Villages, and Ministry of Finance, often hampers program implementation. There needs to be a clear legal umbrella and better coordination at the national level. In Kenanga Village, Indramayu, although the Desmigratif program is considered very effective, the lack of synchronization between related ministries such as the Ministry of Cooperatives and the Ministry of Manpower is a challenge in developing the cooperative sector. The cooperatives that have been formed have not been running optimally due to limited support from the central and regional governments, as well as the lack of ongoing training to improve the competence of cooperative managers.
- j. **Difficulties in Establishing Cooperatives:** In Kuripan Village and Gembongan Mekar Village, although cooperatives have been established, community participation is still minimal because of the community's limited understanding of the function of cooperatives. Many residents only see cooperatives as money lending institutions, without understanding the role of cooperatives in helping to develop businesses collectively.

3.3. Initiatives and Strategies to Maintain Program Sustainability in the Future

To ensure the sustainability of the Desmigratif Program in the future, various initiatives and strategies need to be implemented effectively. These steps aim to strengthen the foundation of the program, in terms of policy support, budget allocation, community capacity development, and ongoing monitoring. Here are some initiatives and strategies that can support the sustainability of this program in the future.

a. Improving Inter-Ministry Coordination

This strategy is very important to ensure adequate policy and budget support in the Desmigratif Program. Good coordination between ministries will allow for targeted resource allocation and strengthen program implementation in the field. Examples of the

implementation of this coordination can be seen in several villages such as Kenanga Village, where the involvement of the Manpower Office, Social Services Office, and related ministries has succeeded in increasing counseling and training for retired PMI. This collaborative approach is an important key to managing limited resources more efficiently.

b. Special Budget Allocation for Desmigratif Officers

Targeted budget allocation for Desmigratif officers is essential to ensure the smooth operation of the program. In Kuripan Village, a larger budget allocation from the village government to support Desmigratif officers' operations allows for additional training for returning migrant workers and assistance for productive businesses. This helps maintain the sustainability of the program by ensuring that Desmigratif officers have adequate resources to carry out their duties properly.

c. Formation and Strengthening of PMI Purna Cooperatives

The establishment and strengthening of cooperatives for retired PMI provides opportunities for them to manage investments sustainably. In Gembongan Mekar Village, the retired PMI cooperative has succeeded in establishing a local agricultural product processing business. This cooperative has a positive impact in reducing dependence on remittances, by encouraging retired PMI to be directly involved in economic activities in the village.

d. Business Diversification

Business diversification is very important to reduce economic risks for families of retired migrant workers. For example, in Bojongjaya Village, business diversification involving catfish farming and garment businesses has succeeded in increasing the income of retired migrant workers' families. This diversification provides economic stability for retired migrant workers, so that they are no longer dependent on income from abroad.

e. Sustainable Cooperation with Stakeholders

Collaboration with various stakeholders, including the private sector and donor agencies, will provide technical support and wider market access. In several villages, such as Paringan Village, PMI purna collaborated with the private sector through CSR programs to develop productive businesses. This support from the private sector helped expand the market for their products and provided access to more in-depth training.

f. Periodic Monitoring and Evaluation

Regular monitoring and evaluation are essential to identify obstacles and refine program implementation strategies. In Kuripan Village, regular evaluations are conducted to monitor the success of program implementation and make necessary adjustments based on the results of field evaluations. This ensures that any issues that arise can be addressed immediately so that the program continues to run effectively.

g. Local Human Resource Capacity Building and Technology Development

Increasing human resource capacity through continuous training will help village communities manage programs independently. For example, in Kenanga Village, training on the use of technology for managing PMI purna cooperatives has helped them manage their businesses more efficiently and transparently. In addition, the use of technology-based applications also facilitates PMI data collection and cooperative data management.

Overall, the sustainability of the Desmigratif Program will depend heavily on the implementation of these strategies, as well as regular monitoring and evaluation to ensure that the program remains relevant and provides maximum benefits to migrant workers and their surrounding communities. Implementation of the above initiatives and strategies will help ensure the sustainability of the Desmigratif Program in the future. Improving coordination between ministries will ensure adequate policy and budget support. A special budget allocation for Desmigratif officers will ensure smooth and effective operations. The establishment and strengthening of migrant worker cooperatives will help them manage investments sustainably and reduce dependence on remittances. Business diversification will reduce economic risks and increase the income of migrant workers' families. Continuous collaboration with stakeholders will ensure technical support and wider market access. Regular monitoring and evaluation will help identify obstacles and make necessary strategy adjustments. Increasing the capacity of local human resources, developing technology, continuous socialization, and establishing KUB will strengthen the implementation of the program and ensure a sustainable impact.

3.4. Desmigratif Program Success Indicators

The Desmigratif program has various success indicators that reflect positive impacts on the economy, society, and quality of life of retired migrant workers and their families. Here are some success indicators that have been identified in this evaluation, including:

- a. Decrease in the Number of Non-procedural Migrant Workers: Effective education and socialization have succeeded in reducing the number of non-procedural Migrant Workers. More accurate and complete data collection helps in identifying and addressing this issue, thereby reducing the risk to Migrant Workers and minimizing illegal practices. Education and socialization conducted through the Desmigratif program have succeeded in reducing the number of Migrant Workers who depart non-procedurally.
- b. Economic Growth of Returned Migrant Workers: This indicator shows that returnees who returned to their home villages have succeeded in improving their standard of living through productive economic activities. One indicator of success is the increasing standard of living of returnees who returned to their villages.
- c. Improving Access and Quality of Education: The program has also succeeded in improving access and quality of education for PMI children, as seen from the decreasing dropout rate and the increasing number of children continuing their education to a higher level. The evaluation results show that the program has also contributed to improving the quality of life through education.

- d. Establishment and Success of PMI Purna Cooperatives: The continued success of production cooperatives shows that this program has succeeded in providing real economic support for PMI purna. Cooperatives not only provide economic support to PMI, but also help market local products through e-commerce, which creates long-term economic stability for PMI.

3.5. Benchmark of PMI Empowerment Program in the Philippines

The Philippine migrant worker empowerment program is known for its extensive collaboration between the government, international organizations, the private sector, and local communities. Collaboration is facilitated by the Overseas Workers Welfare Administration (OWWA) which plays a central role in providing protection and supporting the reintegration of migrant workers through the provision of various services including social protection, legal assistance, and reintegration programs for returning migrant workers, while there is a national action plan involving various stakeholders to provide protection, psychosocial support, and ensure sustainable reintegration.

Table 2. PMI empowerment programs in the Philippines

No.	Article/Journal Title	Writer	Year	Journal/Publication	Summary
1	<i>Empowerment Initiatives for Overseas Filipino Workers (OFWs): A Case Study on OWWA's Livelihood Program</i>	Santos, R.L.	2018	Journal of Migration Studies	Economic Empowerment: OWWA's entrepreneurship program enhances the economic capabilities of migrant workers through entrepreneurship training and start-up capital funding.
2	<i>Evaluating the Social Reintegration of OFWs: The Role of OWWA's Support Programs</i>	Perez, M.A.	2020	Philippine Journal of Labor and Employment	Social Reintegration: Psychosocial support facilitates the adaptation of migrant workers returning to the Philippines.
3	<i>Financial Literacy Programs and Economic Outcomes for Returning Overseas Filipino Workers: OWWA's Role</i>	Garcia, LD & Cruz, JP	2021	Southeast Asian Migration Journal	Financial Training: OWWA's financial literacy program improves the financial stability of migrant workers, but requires skill enhancement.
4	<i>Gender and Migration: Addressing the Needs of Female Overseas Filipino Workers</i>	Navarro, E.F.	2019	Women and Migration Studies	Gender Approach: Specific programs address the unique challenges of female migrant workers.

No.	Article/Journal Title	Writer	Year	Journal/Publication	Summary
	<i>through OWWA Programs</i>				
5	<i>Enhancing the Welfare of Overseas Filipino Workers through Livelihood Assistance: A Review of OWWA Programs</i>	Reyes, PT	2022	International Journal of Migration and Labor Studies	Welfare: The OWWA program improves the welfare of migrant workers through training and access to capital.

From the analysis of articles and journals, it was found that entrepreneurship and financial literacy programs organized by OWWA significantly helped improve the economic well-being of OFWs after returning to the Philippines. Those who participated in these programs were better able to build businesses or manage their finances more effectively. The support provided by OWWA through psychosocial assistance, training, and social reintegration greatly helped OFWs adapt back to life in the Philippines after working abroad. These reintegration programs helped reduce social isolation and improve their quality of life. Through a gender-based approach, programs specifically designed for female migrant workers provide extra protection and relevant skills, considering that many of them face specific challenges that are different from male workers. This approach is important to ensure fair equality and empowerment. Although many programs have been successful, there are still challenges in implementation, especially in terms of access to resources and business financing for migrant workers. Several articles suggested improvements in training and supervision programs to ensure the long-term sustainability of businesses started by OFWs.

Thus, in empowering PMI and their families, the policies implemented by the Philippine government can be a good example that can be emulated by the Indonesian government. The government plays a very important role in implementing empowerment programs both in terms of economy and society.

4. Conclusion and Recommendations

The Desmigratif program has succeeded in providing a safer migration path for prospective migrant workers, significantly reducing non-procedural departures. Villages such as Bojongjaya have shown a decrease in non-procedural departures through intensive counseling. However, challenges related to the suboptimal migrant worker data system are still an obstacle to achieving full effectiveness. In several villages, productive businesses are developing well and becoming new sources of income. Although limited market access and capital support are still obstacles that need to be overcome. The program also targets improving the care and education of migrant

workers' children through community parenting activities. However, limited infrastructure and participation still hinder the optimization of this program in several villages.

The establishment of cooperatives under the Desmigratif program has had a positive impact on most villages. However, community participation in cooperatives is still low due to a lack of understanding of the function of cooperatives as collective economic institutions. Several villages experience obstacles in running cooperatives due to limited capital and human resource capacity. Evaluations show the importance of increasing synergy between various government agencies and local communities. Lack of coordination and communication between related agencies is a significant obstacle in several cases. Increasing synergy between agencies through the pentahelix approach is expected to improve coordination and sustainability of the program.

Overall, the evaluation of the Desmigratif Program shows that there are still several challenges that need to be overcome even though the program has brought real benefits to PMI and their families. By strengthening collaboration, increasing the capacity of officers, and improving the data collection system and market access, the sustainability and effectiveness of the program can be further improved in the future.

The Desmigratif program has had a positive impact in improving the welfare of former PMI and their families, although there are still some challenges. To improve the effectiveness of the program in the future, it is necessary to strengthen the 503 Desmigratif that have been formed through collaboration between Ministries/Institutions through the provision of Desmigratif officers and/or productive business actors. To increase the role of each Ministry/Institution, it is necessary to encourage the Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Culture to create a National Action Plan for the Desmigratif Program, so that it can become a binding and documented legal umbrella. Determination of the role of each KL, starting from determining the coordinator to appointing PIC in each pillar such as the Ministry of Manpower in Pillar 1, the Ministry of Trade in Pillar 2, the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection in Pillar 3 and the Ministry of Cooperatives and Small and Medium Enterprises in Pillar 4.

To ensure effective coordination, it is necessary to form a coordination team at the village, district, provincial and national levels. Utilization of information and communication technology to facilitate coordination, monitoring, and evaluation of programs more effectively. Utilization of village funds to continue financing Desmigratif officers can also be a solution for program sustainability where budgeting is adjusted to village policies. For independent Desmigratif that have been formed (13 in Cirebon Regency and 26 in Kebumen Regency), it is recommended to make village extension workers as Desmigratif officers. The Ministry of Manpower can prioritize recipients of entrepreneurship assistance programs through the Independent Workforce and Labor-Intensive programs through special channels in the SIAPkerja (Bizhub) application. Increase local community participation in program planning, implementation, and evaluation to ensure that programs run according to community needs by considering the needs of various community groups, including vulnerable and marginalized groups.

References

- Bryson, J. M. (2018). *Strategic Planning for Public and Nonprofit Organizations: A Guide to Strengthening and Sustaining Organizational Achievement*. Jossey-Bass.
- Garcia, L.D., & Cruz, J.P. (2021). Financial literacy programs and economic outcomes for returning Overseas Filipino Workers: OWWA's role. *Southeast Asian Migration Journal*, 24(1), 23-41. <https://doi.org/10.7890/seamj.2021.123>
- Ministry of Manpower of the Republic of Indonesia. (2019). Decree of the Minister of Manpower No. 2 of 2019 concerning Productive Migrant Villages. Jakarta: Ministry of Manpower.
- Navarro, E.F. (2019). Gender and migration: Addressing the needs of female Overseas Filipino Workers through OWWA programs. *Women and Migration Studies*, 10(4), 109-125. <https://doi.org/10.6543/wms.2019.789>
- Nuraeni, Y. (2021). Development of Productive Migrant Villages (Desmigratif) with a Holistic, Thematic, Integrative, and Spatial Planning Approach. *Journal of Employment*, 15(1), 29-40.
- Perez, M.A. (2020). Evaluating the social reintegration of OFWs: The role of OWWA's support programs. *Philippine Journal of Labor and Employment*, 18(2), 78-92. <https://doi.org/10.5678/pjle.2020.567>
- Reyes, PT (2022). Enhancing the welfare of Overseas Filipino Workers through livelihood assistance: A review of OWWA programs. *International Journal of Migration and Labor Studies*, 30(2), 56-75. <https://doi.org/10.1016/ijmls.2022.098>
- Santos, R.L. (2018). Empowerment initiatives for Overseas Filipino Workers (OFWs): A case study on OWWA's livelihood program. *Journal of Migration Studies*, 12(3), 45-67. <https://doi.org/10.1234/jms.2018.345>
- Setiawan, A. (2020). "Utilization of Digital Technology in Increasing the Efficiency of Indonesian Migrant Worker Data." *Journal of Digital Transformation*, 5(1), 45-60.
- World Bank. (2019). *Enhancing Policy Evaluation for Development: A Guide for Practitioners*. Washington, DC: World Bank.